



1503 N. IMPERIAL AVE., SUITE 104
EL CENTRO, CA 92243-2875
PHONE: (760) 592-4494
FAX: (760) 592-4410

April 28, 2023

SOCIAL SERVICES TRANSPORTATION ADVISORY COUNCIL (SSTAC) AGENDA

DATE: Wednesday, May 03, 2023
TIME: 10:00 a.m.
LOCATION : ICTC Office
1503 N. Imperial Ave., Suite 104
El Centro, CA 92243

Join Zoom Meeting
<https://us06web.zoom.us/j/82312923377?pwd=bEFKSHR2Vk96aUg3RGtUWTZzZlVhUT09>
(669) 900-9128
Meeting ID: 823 1292 3377
Passcode: 966787

Chairperson: Dr. Kathleen Lang

Vice-Chair: Sarah Enz

Individuals wishing accessibility accommodations at this meeting, under the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), may request such accommodations to aid hearing, visual, or mobility impairment by contacting ICTC offices at (760) 592-4494. Please note that 48 hours advance notice will be necessary to honor your request.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Any member of the public may address the Committee for a period not to exceed three minutes on any item of interest not on the agenda within the jurisdiction of the Committee. The Committee will listen to all communication, but in compliance with the Brown Act, will not take any actions on items that are not on the agenda.

DISCUSSION/ACTION/INFORMATION ITEMS

1. Introduction
2. Approval of Minutes of February 01, 2023 and April 05, 2023 *ACTION*
3. TDA Triennial Performance Audit PRESENTATION
By Moore and Associates Staff
4. UTN 2023-24 Findings INFORMATION/ACTION
SSTAC UTN Findings Letter
By ICTC Staff
5. CTSA Reports DISCUSSION
By ICTC Staff Transit Dept.

**CITIES OF BRAWLEY, CALEXICO, CALIPATRIA, EL CENTRO, HOLTVILLE, IMPERIAL, WESTMORLAND,
IMPERIAL IRRIGATION DISTRICT AND COUNTY OF IMPERIAL**

SOCIAL SERVICES TRANSPORTATION ADVISORY COUNCIL (SSTAC) AGENDA | 2

6. Transit Operator Updates INFORMATION/DISCUSSION
By First Transit Staff
- a. Imperial Valley Transit (IVT)
 - b. IVT Access
 - c. IVT Ride
 - i. Brawley
 - ii. Calexico
 - iii. El Centro
 - iv. Imperial
 - v. West Shores
 - d. IVT MedTrans
7. General Discussion DISCUSSION
All
8. Adjournment *ACTION*

The next meeting is scheduled for June 07, 2023. For questions or comments, please call Gustavo Gomez at 760-592-4494, or can email at gustavogomez@imperialctc.org.

**CITIES OF BRAWLEY, CALEXICO, CALIPATRIA, EL CENTRO, HOLTVILLE, IMPERIAL, WESTMORLAND,
IMPERIAL IRRIGATION DISTRICT AND COUNTY OF IMPERIAL**



1503 N. IMPERIAL AVE., SUITE 104
EL CENTRO, CA 92243-2875
PHONE: (760) 592-4494
FAX: (760) 592-4410

SOCIAL SERVICES TRANSPORTATION ADVISORY COUNCIL

MINUTES

February 1, 2023

Present

Voting Attendees:

Kathleen Lang	California Health & Wellness
Priscilla Lopez	Workforce & Economic Development
Mitzi Perez	ARC-IV
Karina Leon	Access to Independence
Sarah Enz	Area Agency on Aging (AAA)
Gustavo Gomez	CTSA-ICTC

Non-Voting Attendees:

Helio Sanchez	IVT
Cesar Sanchez	IVT
Jose Guillen	IVT MedTrans
Karla Pacheco	IVT Access
Karla Aguilar	IVT Ride
Liz Santucci	Caltrans
Angela Delgadillo	ICTC
Esperanza Avila	ICTC
Karra Cardone	IC Public Health
Joshua Lopez	IVC

1. Dr. Lang called the meeting to order at 10:11 a.m. **A quorum was present.** Introductions were made.
 - Hybrid meeting.
2. SSTAC Remote Resolution.
 - SSTAC members reviewed the resolution and motioned to approve it as is. ([Perez](#), [Lopez](#)), **Motion Carried.**
 - Required signatures will be collected after the meeting.
3. Minutes were adopted for January 4, 2023. ([Enz](#), [Perez](#)), **Motion Carried.**
4. CTSA Reports:

Mr. Gomez had the following updates:

- Staff attended events during January; Senior Health Fair at Holtville and Imperial Gardens Senior Apartments and at City of Calexico distributing Calexico On-Demand brochures
 - On February 16th, ICTC Staff will be presenting an IVT presentation at Villa De La Flores Senior Apartments in Calexico.
 - The UTN survey is now live until March 3rd. So far, there have been about 30-40 comments on the survey.
 - Calexico On-Demand is going along very well. There are about 180 passengers per day.
 - The bus shelter on Cole Rd. is now in place at the City of Calexico.
5. FY 2023-24 Master Needs List, UTN Letter to the hearing Panel Review (DRAFT)
- Mr. Gomez discussed the current Master Needs list and mentioned that the requested changes have been made to the list. He stated that changes can still be done to the list if requested.
 - Dr. Kathleen Lang asked if there can be a revision made on the second general comments on the letter. The IVT Garnet Line in Calexico should be revised to the new Microtransit service: Calexico On-Demand.
 - SSTAC members recommended to revise #2 on the priority list. The revision will be to add bus stop improvement to the new public library in El Centro.
 - SSTAC members recommended to revise #3 on the priority list. The revision will be to explore and analyze senior transportation needs in the north end.
 - A motion was made for staff to revise the FY 2023-24 Master Needs List, UTN Letter and will finalize at the next meeting. (Lopez, Perez), **Motion Carried.**
6. Transit Operator FY 2022-23 Reports:

Imperial Valley Transit

- There is a slight increase in ridership as time goes by.
- On page 13 of the agenda the 2nd Quarterly Review is attached for reference.

IVT Access

- Ms. Pacheco mentioned that service is running as usual.
- On page 14 of the agenda the 2nd Quarterly Review is attached for reference.

IVT Ride

- Ms. Aguilar stated that the service is running as usual and mentioned some of the events that IVT Ride participated in the last month.
- The service is still providing free fares, sponsored by Area Agency on Aging.
- On page 15 of the agenda the 2nd Quarterly Review is attached for reference.

IVT MedTrans

- Mr. Guillen mentioned that service hours are the same and both buses are available. It is in response to demand.
- On page 16 of the agenda the 2nd Quarterly Review is attached for reference.

7. General Discussion

- There was no general discussion.

8. Adjournment

- The meeting adjourned at 10:55 a.m.
- The next meeting will be held on Wednesday, March 1, 2023, at the Imperial County Transportation Commission Office, 1503 N. Imperial Ave., Suite 104, El Centro, CA 92243.



1503 N. IMPERIAL AVE., SUITE 104
EL CENTRO, CA 92243-2875
PHONE: (760) 592-4494
FAX: (760) 592-4410

SOCIAL SERVICES TRANSPORTATION ADVISORY COUNCIL

MINUTES

April 05, 2023

Present

Voting Attendees:

Ted Ceasar	Consumer
Mike Hack	Consumer
Kathleen Lang	California Health & Wellness
Priscilla Lopez	Workforce & Economic Development
Karina Leon	Access to Independence
Cristina Leal	ARC- Imperial Valley
Gustavo Gomez	CTSA-ICTC

Non-Voting Attendees:

Helio Sanchez	IVT
Cesar Sanchez	IVT
Jose Guillen	IVT MedTrans
Karla Pacheco	IVT Access
Karla Aguilar	IVT Ride
Liz Santucci	Caltrans
Angela Delgadillo	ICTC
Esperanza Avila	ICTC

1. Dr. Lang called the meeting to order at 10:01 a.m. **A quorum was present.**
2. Introductions were made.
 - Hybrid meeting.
3. Minutes were adopted for March 01, 2023. (**Hack, Ceasar**), **Motion Carried.**
4. CTSA Reports:

Mr. Gomez had the following updates:

- Continuing to assist in sign-ups for IVT Ride and Access via phone.
- Unmet Transit Needs (UTN) Public hearing on April 06, 2023
- Staff attended an event during February, Senior Health Fair at Holtville, and Imperial Gardens
- On February 16th, ICTC Staff presented an IVT presentation at Villa De La Flores Senior Apartments in Calexico.

- On March 15th, ICTC staff will attend the Niland Children's Fair, and on March 17, IVC Transitions Fair

5. Transit Operator FY 2022-23 Reports:

Imperial Valley Transit

- There is a slight increase in ridership as time goes by.

IVT Access

- Ms. Pacheco mentioned that the service is running as usual.
- Community event at the Senior Apartments in Imperial and in Holtville, April 06, 2023

IVT Ride

- Ms. Aguilar stated that the service is running as usual and mentioned some of the events that IVT Ride participated in the last month.

IVT MedTrans

- Mr. Guillen mentioned that service hours are the same and both buses are available. It is in response to demand.

6. General Discussion

- Mr. Gomez stated Calexico on demand is now charging. The wait time has increased due to high demand. Additionally, he said they are considering bringing in more vehicles.

7. Adjournment

- The meeting adjourned at 10:19 a.m.
- The next meeting will be held on Wednesday, May 03, 2023, at the Imperial County Transportation Commission Office, 1503 N. Imperial Ave., Suite 104, El Centro, CA 92243.

IMPERIAL COUNTY TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

**TDA Triennial Performance Audits,
FY 2019/20 – FY 2021/22**

SSTAC Meeting

May 3, 2023



TDA AUDIT OVERVIEW

- The California Public Utilities Code requires all RTPAs conduct an independent Triennial Performance Audit in order to be eligible for Transportation Development Act (TDA) funding under Article 4
- Triennial Performance Audits are encouraged for Article 8 funding recipients
- In late 2022, the ICTC selected Moore & Associates, Inc., to prepare Triennial Performance Audits of itself as the RTPA and the five transit operators to which it allocates TDA funding
 - Imperial Valley Transit
 - IVT Access
 - IVT Ride
 - IVT MedTrans
 - Fort Yuma Quechan Indian Tribe (YCAT Routes 5 & 10)

ICTC AS THE RTPA

Five prior recommendations

1. Ensure State Controller Reports are submitted in a timely manner. – **Implementation in progress**
2. Ensure the RTPA's fiscal audits are completed no later than 12 months following the end of the fiscal year, and that operator audits for which ICTC is responsible are submitted no later than 180 days after the end of the fiscal year (plus a 90-day extension). - **Implemented**
3. For any operator using STA funds for operating purposes, ICTC should include the test against the two qualifying efficiency standards as part of the TDA claim process. - **Implemented**
4. Prepare and implement a standardized orientation process for new ICTC Board members. - **Implemented**
5. Reaffirm ICTC's definitions of "unmet transit need" and "reasonable to meet" as part of each annual unmet transit needs process. – **Not implemented**

ICTC AS THE RTPA

Two current findings and recommendations

Both carried over from the prior audit.

- 1. Finding:** State Controller Reports were submitted after the stipulated deadline in FY 2020/21 and FY 2021/22.
Recommendation: Ensure State Controller Reports are submitted in a timely manner.
- 2. Finding:** The ICTC does not reaffirm its definitions of “unmet transit need” and “reasonable to meet” as part of its annual unmet transit needs findings.
Recommendation: Reaffirm ICTC’s definitions of “unmet transit need” and “reasonable to meet” as part of each annual unmet transit needs finding.

IMPERIAL VALLEY TRANSIT

Three prior recommendations

1. Ensure State Controller Reports are submitted in a timely manner. – **Not implemented**
2. Ensure TDA fiscal audits of all IVT operations are completed no later than 270 days following the end of the fiscal year. – **Implemented**
3. IVT should ensure its website is fully usable for monolingual Spanish-speaking individuals. – **Implementation in progress**

IMPERIAL VALLEY TRANSIT

Two current findings and recommendations

- 1. Finding:** State Controller Reports were submitted after the stipulated deadline in FY 2020/21 and FY 2021/22.

Recommendation: Ensure State Controller Reports are submitted in a timely manner.
- 2. Finding:** The TDA fiscal audit does not show how the farebox recovery ratio is calculated, only provides the actual ratio against the required ratio.

Recommendation: Include a detailed breakdown of the farebox recovery ratio calculation in future TDA fiscal audits.

IVT ACCESS

Three prior recommendations

1. Ensure State Controller Reports are submitted in a timely manner. – **Not implemented**
2. Ensure TDA fiscal audits of all IVT operations are completed no later than 270 days following the end of the fiscal year. – **Implemented**
3. Identify supplemental local revenues that will bring the farebox recovery ratio up to at least 10 percent. – **Not implemented**

IVT ACCESS

Three current findings and recommendations

- 1. Finding:** State Controller Reports were submitted after the stipulated deadline in FY 2020/21 and FY 2021/22.

Recommendation: Ensure State Controller Reports are submitted in a timely manner.
- 2. Finding:** The TDA fiscal audit does not show how the farebox recovery ratio is calculated, only provides the actual ratio against the required ratio.

Recommendation: Include a detailed breakdown of the farebox recovery ratio calculation in future TDA fiscal audits.
- 3. Finding:** IVT Access is not on track to be in compliance with the farebox recovery requirement when the penalty waiver ends after FY 2022/23.

Recommendation: Identify strategies that will enable IVT Access to meet the 10 percent farebox recovery ratio requirement.

IVT RIDE

Three prior recommendations

1. Ensure State Controller Reports are submitted in a timely manner. – **Not implemented**
2. Ensure TDA fiscal audits of all IVT operations are completed no later than 270 days following the end of the fiscal year. – **Implemented**
3. Implement a fare adjustment or identify supplemental local revenues that will enable each IVT Ride service to meet its farebox recovery ratio target. – **Not implemented**

IVT RIDE

Four current recommendations

- 1. Finding:** State Controller Reports were submitted after the stipulated deadline in FY 2020/21 and FY 2021/22.

Recommendation: Ensure State Controller Reports are submitted in a timely manner.
- 2. Finding:** The TDA fiscal audit does not show how the farebox recovery ratio is calculated, only provides the actual ratio against the required ratio.

Recommendation: Include a detailed breakdown of the farebox recovery ratio calculation in future TDA fiscal audits.
- 3. Finding:** IVT Ride is not on track to be in compliance with the farebox recovery requirement when the penalty waiver ends after FY 2022/23.

Recommendation: Identify strategies that will enable IVT Ride to meet the 10 percent farebox recovery ratio requirement.
- 4. Finding:** IVT Ride service information online is outdated and does not include the Heber service.

Recommendation: Update IVT Ride service information to reflect the current service and provide essential service information.

IVT MEDTRANS

Four prior recommendations

1. Ensure State Controller Reports are submitted in a timely manner. – **Not implemented**
2. Ensure TDA fiscal audits of all IVT operations are completed no later than 270 days following the end of the fiscal year. – **Implemented**
3. Identify marketing strategies to grow ridership and/or identify supplemental local revenues that will bring the farebox recovery ratio up to at least 10 percent. – **Not implemented**
4. Conduct a survey of IVT MedTrans customers, either as a stand-alone survey or as part of a larger, system-wide survey effort. – **Partially implemented**

IVT MEDTRANS

Three current findings and recommendations

- 1. Finding:** State Controller Reports were submitted after the stipulated deadline in FY 2020/21 and FY 2021/22.

Recommendation: Ensure State Controller Reports are submitted in a timely manner.
- 2. Finding:** The TDA fiscal audit does not show how the farebox recovery ratio is calculated, only provides the actual ratio against the required ratio.

Recommendation: Include a detailed breakdown of the farebox recovery ratio calculation in future TDA fiscal audits.
- 3. Finding:** IVT MedTrans is not on track to be in compliance with the farebox recovery requirement when the penalty waiver ends after FY 2022/23.

Recommendation: Identify strategies that will enable IVT MedTrans to meet the 10 percent farebox recovery ratio requirement.

FORT YUMA QUECHAN TRIBE

Two prior recommendations

1. Ensure State Controller Reports are submitted in a timely manner. –
Implemented
2. Ensure the State Controller Report is reviewed by someone other than the individual who prepared it so as to identify any errors in reporting. –
Implemented

No current findings or recommendations

IMPACT OF COVID-19

- Additional cleaning protocols and protective equipment implemented
- Significant reduction in ridership/demand
- Reduced levels of service on some IVT routes
- Fewer vehicles deployed for IVT Access and IVT Ride
- Decrease in hours of service for IVT Ride
- Reduction in number of trips per week for IVT MedTrans
- Ridership/demand has yet to fully recover in some areas

THANK YOU



1503 N. IMPERIAL AVE. SUITE 104
EL CENTRO, CA 92243-2875
PHONE: (760) 592-4494
FAX: (760) 592-4410

April 24, 2023

**UNMET TRANSIT NEEDS FINDINGS
FISCAL YEAR 2023-24**

The Imperial County Unmet Transit Needs Public Hearing was conducted at 3:00 p.m., on April 6, 2023, at Imperial County Transportation Commission offices via zoom. After review and consideration of the testimony received at the hearing, this Panel reconvened on April 24, 2023 to make the following “Findings”:

The following “Findings” are unmet transit needs or transit needs which are reasonable to meet. The ICTC Transit Financing Plan and TDA claims for Fiscal Year 2023-24 shall be approved consistent with these stated “Findings”.

- I. Existing transit services should be continued:
 - A. IVT RIDE – Brawley, Calexico, El Centro, Heber, Imperial and Westshores
 - B. County-Wide Transit System- Imperial Valley Transit
 - C. ADA Paratransit Services – IVT Access
 - D. IVT MedTrans

- II. Staff will continue the required coordination and administration of the new microtransit service in the City of Calexico.

- III. Continue coordination between existing transit services, including paratransit services provided by both public and social service agencies. ICTC staff shall provide recommendations and technical assistance when requested by social service and public agencies.

- IV. All transit services shall comply with the American's with Disabilities Act of 1990; provisions specific to respective services offered.

**CITIES OF BRAWLEY, CALEXICO, CALIPATRIA, EL CENTRO, HOLTVILLE, IMPERIAL, WESTMORLAND,
IMPERIAL IRRIGATION DISTRICT AND COUNTY OF IMPERIAL**

- V. All transit services shall comply with the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) and/or Federal Highway Administration (FHWA) Drug and Alcohol Testing rules; provisions specific to respective services offered.
- VI. Staff will continue to pursue resources for the implementation of the proposed IVT Red Line in Imperial.
- VII. Staff will continue to provide technical assistance to the City of Calexico for the development of the City's transfer terminal project.
- VIII. Staff will continue to pursue resources for the implementation of service changes in accordance with the priorities in the FY 2023-24 Unmet Needs List (attachment).

All other services and issues as presented by written or verbal testimony are hereby declared as not reasonable to meet, at this time.




Mike Goodsell, Council Member
City of Holtville



Martha Cardenas-Singh, Council Member
City of El Centro

STAFF:



David Aguirre
Executive Director



1503 N. IMPERIAL AVE., SUITE 104
EL CENTRO, CA 92243-2875
PHONE: (760) 592-4494
FAX: (760) 592-4410

APRIL 24, 2023

UNMET TRANSIT NEEDS LIST FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

Priority order

1. Add mobile ticketing fare option (e.g, passengers, third parties), per action taken by ICTC XX-XX-23
2. Provide bus stop improvement (e.g., seating and shade) along the new El Centro Public Library on Imperial Avenue, *per action taken by ICTC XX-XX-23*
3. Explore and analyze transportation needs at Northern cities within the Imperial County, *per action taken by ICTC XX-XX-23*
4. Add an IVC Express Route from Calexico to IVC and from IVC to Calexico in the evening after 5:30PM, from Monday thru Friday (SRTP, 2018) *Per action taken by ICTC XX-XX-23*
5. Implement a bus stop closer to The Plaza in El Centro near the Imperial Valley Mall, *per action taken by ICTC XX-XX-23*

SOCIAL SERVICES TRANSPORTATION ADVISORY COUNCIL

Kathleen Lang, Chairperson
SarahENZ, Vice-Chair
Gustavo Gomez, Secretary

1503 N. Imperial Ave., Suite 104
El Centro, CA 92243
(760) 592-4494

May 3, 2023

Mike Goodsell, Chairperson
Imperial County Transportation Commission
1503 N. Imperial Ave., Suite 104
El Centro, CA 92243

Dear Commissioner Goodsell:

One of the responsibilities of the Social Services Transportation Advisory Council (SSTAC) is to advise ICTC on existing public transportation needs. In addition, the SSTAC must review the "Findings" as developed by the Public Hearing Panel. SSTAC met on May 3, 2023 and reviewed the "Findings" as developed by the Public Hearing Panel on April 24, 2022. SSTAC appreciates the proactive consideration given by the Transit Hearing Panel for the acknowledgement of addressing the "Findings" in previous years.

It is the interest of the SSTAC that should funding be identified for FY 2023-24 or subsequent years, that the issues noted in the Unmet Transit Needs List be implemented in order of priority:

1. Add a mobile ticketing fare option (e.g./ passengers, third parties)
2. Provide bus stop improvement (e.g., seating and shade) along the new El Centro Public Library on Imperial Avenue.
3. Explore and analyze transportation needs at Northern cities within the Imperial County.
4. Add an IVC Express Route from Calexico to IVC and from IVC to Calexico in the evening after 5:30pm.

We appreciate the opportunity to participate in the evaluation and delivery of transit services.

Sincerely,

Dr. Kathleen Lang
Chairperson